

UNITED STATES SENATE  
COMMITTEE ON THE JUDICIARY

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR JUDICIAL NOMINEES

PUBLIC

1. **Name:** State full name (include any former names used).

Susan Paradise Baxter  
Former Name: Susan Rose Paradise

2. **Position:** State the position for which you have been nominated.

United States District Judge for the Western District of Pennsylvania

3. **Address:** List current office address. If city and state of residence differs from your place of employment, please list the city and state where you currently reside.

United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania  
17 South Park Row, Room A280  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501

4. **Birthplace:** State date and place of birth.

1956; Latrobe, Pennsylvania

5. **Education:** List in reverse chronological order each college, law school, or any other institution of higher education attended and indicate for each the dates of attendance, whether a degree was received, and the date each degree was received.

1980 – 1983, Temple University School of Law; J.D., 1983  
1978 – 1980, Temple University; M.Ed., 1980  
1974 – 1978, Pennsylvania State University; B.S., 1978

6. **Employment Record:** List in reverse chronological order all governmental agencies, business or professional corporations, companies, firms, or other enterprises, partnerships, institutions or organizations, non-profit or otherwise, with which you have been affiliated as an officer, director, partner, proprietor, or employee since graduation from college, whether or not you received payment for your services. Include the name and address of the employer and job title or description.

1995 – present  
United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania

17 South Park Row, Room A280  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
United States Magistrate Judge (1995 – present)  
Chief United States Magistrate Judge (2005 – 2009)

1994  
Court of Common Pleas of Erie County  
140 West Sixth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
Court Solicitor

1983 – 1992  
Cole, Raywid & Braverman (now Davis Wright Tremaine LLP)  
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, District of Columbia 20006  
Partner (1989 – 1992)  
Associate (1983 – 1989)

1982 – 1983  
Honorable Clifford Scott Green  
United States District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania  
601 Market Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19106  
Part-Time Student Law Clerk

Summer 1982  
Obermayer Rebmann Maxwell & Hippel  
One Penn Center, 19th Floor  
1617 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
Summer Associate

Summer 1981  
Honorable Howard F. Reed, Jr.  
Delaware County Court of Common Pleas  
1068 West Baltimore Pike  
Media, Pennsylvania 19063  
Law Clerk Intern

1978 – 1981  
Wallingford-Swarthmore School District  
200 South Providence Road  
Wallingford, Pennsylvania 19086  
Teacher

Summer 1978  
Sears  
Granite Run Mall  
1067 West Baltimore Pike  
Media, Pennsylvania 19063  
Part-Time Sales Clerk

Other Affiliations (uncompensated):

2013 – present  
Erie Arts & Culture (formerly ArtsErie)  
Three East Fourth Street, Suite Ten  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16507  
Board of Directors Member

2012 – present  
DramaShop  
Renaissance Centre, Second Floor  
1001 State Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
Board of Directors Member

2012 – 2016  
Villa Maria Elementary School  
2551 West Eighth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16505  
Trustee (2012 – 2016)  
Secretary (2013 – 2015)

2009 – 2015  
Evelyn Lincoln Institute for Ethics & Society  
Mercyhurst University  
501 East 38th Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16546  
Board of Directors Member

2009 – 2011  
Mercyhurst Prep Creative Arts Boosters  
Mercyhurst Preparatory School  
538 Grandview Boulevard  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16504  
President

2003 – 2006  
Erie Playhouse  
13 West Tenth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
Board of Directors Member (2003 – 2006)  
President (2004 – 2006)

2003 – 2005  
Erie County Bar Association  
302 West Ninth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16502  
Board of Directors Member

1998 – 2000  
Governor's Pennsylvania Commission for Women  
508E Main Capitol Building  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120  
Commission Member

1996 – 2000  
Federal Magistrate Judges Association  
224 Blue Jay Way  
Stanardsville, Virginia 22973  
Board of Directors Member

1993 – 1994  
Sarah Reed Retirement Center  
227 West 22nd Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16502  
Board of Directors Member

7. **Military Service and Draft Status:** Identify any service in the U.S. Military, including dates of service, branch of service, rank or rate, serial number (if different from social security number) and type of discharge received, and whether you have registered for selective service.

I have not served in the military and have not registered for selective service, as I was not required to do so.

8. **Honors and Awards:** List any scholarships, fellowships, honorary degrees, academic or professional honors, honorary society memberships, military awards, and any other special recognition for outstanding service or achievement.

Honorary Lifetime Membership, Federal Bar Association (2015)

Laker Legend Award (co-recipient), Mercyhurst Preparatory School (2013)

Woman of the Year Award, The Women's Roundtable of Erie (2008)

Congressional Certificate of Achievement (2008)

Erie County Executive Commendation for Community Service (2008)

Honorary Chair, 12th Annual Woman's Day Festivities (2008)

Applause Award (co-recipient), Arts Council of Erie (2006)

Alumni "Hero of Imagination," Derry Area Senior High School (2001)

Outstanding Young Women in America (1997)

Alumni Graduation Award, Temple University School of Law (1983)

Winner, Polsky Moot Court Competition (1982)

Omicron Delta Kappa, Pennsylvania State University (1977)

Parmi Nous Honor Society, Pennsylvania State University (1977)

Mortar Board, Pennsylvania State University (1976)

9. **Bar Associations:** List all bar associations or legal or judicial-related committees, selection panels or conferences of which you are or have been a member, and give the titles and dates of any offices which you have held in such groups.

Erie County Bar Association

Women's Division, Chair (2014 – 2016)

Board of Directors (2003 – 2005)

Mediation Program Development Committee, Chair (2003 – 2004)

Federal Bar Association, Member

Federal Magistrate Judges Association

Board of Directors Member (1996 – 2000)

Long Range Planning Committee Member (2009 – present, Co-Chair, 2011 – 2012, 2014 – 2015)

Civil Rules Committee Member (2011 – present)

Magistrate Judges Advisory Board, *Ex-Officio* Member  
Administrative Office of the United States Courts (1996 – 2000)

Magistrate Judges Committee, Member  
Third Circuit Governance Committee (2006 – 2009)

Northwest Pennsylvania American Inn of Court, Member  
Program Director (1999 – 2000)

Pennsylvania Bar Association, Member  
Commission on Women in the Profession (1992 – present)

Space and Security Advisory Council, Member  
Administrative Office of the United States Courts (2009 – 2010)  
Third Circuit Governance Committee (2010 – 2017)

10. **Bar and Court Admission:**

- a. List the date(s) you were admitted to the bar of any state and any lapses in membership. Please explain the reason for any lapse in membership.

Pennsylvania, 1992  
District of Columbia, 1983

Following my taking the bench in January 1995, I allowed my membership in the District of Columbia Bar to lapse that year. There has been no other lapse in membership.

- b. List all courts in which you have been admitted to practice, including dates of admission and any lapses in membership. Please explain the reason for any lapse in membership. Give the same information for administrative bodies that require special admission to practice.

Supreme Court of the United States, 1987  
United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit, 1984  
United States District Court for the District of Columbia, 1984  
District of Columbia Court of Appeals, 1983  
Supreme Court of Pennsylvania, 1992

There have been no lapses in membership.

11. **Memberships:**

- a. List all professional, business, fraternal, scholarly, civic, charitable, or other organizations, other than those listed in response to Questions 9 or 10 to which you belong, or to which you have belonged, since graduation from law school. Provide dates of membership or participation, and indicate any office you held. Include clubs, working groups, advisory or editorial boards, panels, committees, conferences, or publications.

Arts Council of Erie (1999)

Chi Omega Fraternity (1975 – present)

Croatian Fraternal Union (1956 – present)

DramaShop

Board of Directors (2012 – present)

Education Task Force for Sisters of St. Joseph, Erie, Co-Chair (2007 – 2008)

Erie Arts & Culture (formerly ArtsErie)

Board of Directors (2013 – present)

Erie Club (1995 – present)

Erie County Medical Society Alliance (1992 – present)

Erie Playhouse

Board of Directors (2003 – 2006)

President (2004 – 2006)

Erie Philharmonic Orchestra (various support committees) (1997 – 2001)

Erie Zoological Society (1993 – 2002)

Evelyn Lincoln Institute for Ethics & Society, Mercyhurst University

Board of Directors (2009 – present)

ExpERIEnce Children's Museum (Earned Income Committee) (1994)

Governor's Pennsylvania Commission for Women (1998 – 2000)

Mercyhurst Prep Creative Arts Boosters (2003 – 2011)

President (2009 – 2011)

National Association for the Advancement of Colored People – Erie Branch  
(2014 – 2015)

Oratorio Society of Washington, D.C. (1984 – 1986)

Order of Sons of Italy in America - Lake Erie Lodge (2000 – 2003)

Pennsylvania Medical Society Alliance (1992 – present)

The Pennsylvania Society (2014 – present)

Sarah Reed Retirement Center  
Board of Directors (1993 – 1994)

Villa Maria Elementary Parent Association (1995 – 2007)

Villa Maria Elementary School Board  
Trustee (2012 – 2016)  
Secretary (2013 – 2015)

The Women's Roundtable of Erie (2008 – 2015)

- b. The American Bar Association's Commentary to its Code of Judicial Conduct states that it is inappropriate for a judge to hold membership in any organization that invidiously discriminates on the basis of race, sex, or religion, or national origin. Indicate whether any of these organizations listed in response to 11a above currently discriminate or formerly discriminated on the basis of race, sex, religion or national origin either through formal membership requirements or the practical implementation of membership policies. If so, describe any action you have taken to change these policies and practices.

To my knowledge, the Women's Roundtable of Erie and the Governor's Pennsylvania Commission for Women are comprised of only women working on behalf of women's issues. Chi Omega Fraternity is a sorority I joined in college whose membership is restricted to women only. Prior to my becoming a member, the Erie Club restricted membership to men. To the best of my knowledge, none of the other organizations listed above currently discriminates or formerly discriminated on the basis of race, sex, religion or national origin, either through formal membership requirements or the practical implementation of membership policies.

12. **Published Writings and Public Statements:**



- a. List the titles, publishers, and dates of books, articles, reports, letters to the editor, editorial pieces, or other published material you have written or edited, including material published only on the Internet. Supply one (1) electronic copy of all published material to the Committee.

None.

- b. Supply four (4) copies of any reports, memoranda or policy statements you prepared or contributed in the preparation of on behalf of any bar association, committee, conference, or organization of which you were or are a member. If you do not have a copy of a report, memorandum or policy statement, give the name and address of the organization that issued it, the date of the document, and a summary of its subject matter.

The Rules Committee of the Federal Magistrate Judges Association, of which I was a member, filed comments on the then-proposed amendments to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure in February 2014. A copy is supplied.

The Education Task Force for Sisters of St. Joseph, which I co-chaired from 2007 to 2008, submitted a final report to the Congregation of Sisters of St. Joseph of Northwestern Pennsylvania, providing options for the future of Villa Maria Academy. A copy is supplied.

The Mediation Program Development Committee for the Erie County Bar Association, which I chaired from 2003 to 2004, submitted proposed procedures and forms as a final report. This is the Mediation Program currently offered by the Erie County Bar Association. A copy is supplied.

- c. Supply four (4) copies of any testimony, official statements or other communications relating, in whole or in part, to matters of public policy or legal interpretation, that you have issued or provided or that others presented on your behalf to public bodies or public officials.

None.

- d. Supply four (4) copies, transcripts or recordings of all speeches or talks delivered by you, including commencement speeches, remarks, lectures, panel discussions, conferences, political speeches, and question-and-answer sessions. Include the date and place where they were delivered, and readily available press reports about the speech or talk. If you do not have a copy of the speech or a transcript or recording of your remarks, give the name and address of the group before whom the speech was given, the date of the speech, and a summary of its subject matter. If you did not speak from a prepared text, furnish a copy of any outline or notes from which you spoke.

I have not maintained a comprehensive list of the speeches or talks that I have delivered. To discover the presentations described below, I have searched my personal files and the Internet, and contacted the organizations sponsoring these events.

May 1995 – present (various dates): Speaker, Naturalization Ceremonies, United States Courthouse for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Erie, Pennsylvania. I delivered short remarks in the ceremonies in which I was not presiding and administered the oath of citizenship and delivered lengthier remarks as the presider, at the dates listed below. Both sets of remarks are supplied.

Presiding: October 27, 2017; September 19, 2017; September 6, 2017; June 2, 2017; May 10, 2017; April 12, 2017; March 8, 2017; February 3, 2017; December 2, 2016; October 19, 2016; September 9, 2016; July 15, 2016; June 3, 2016; March 4, 2016; December 4, 2015; September 4, 2015; June 5, 2015; March 6, 2015; December 5, 2014; September 5, 2014; June 6, 2014; March 7, 2014; December 6, 2013; September 6, 2013.

Not presiding: June 7, 2013; March 1, 2013; December 7, 2012; September 7, 2012; June 1, 2012; March 2, 2012; December 2, 2011; June 3, 2011; March 18, 2011; November 12, 2010; September 24, 2010; June 25, 2010; March 26, 2010; November 13, 2009; August 14, 2009; June 26, 2009; March 27, 2009; November 21, 2008; September 12, 2008; August 8, 2008; June 20, 2008; March 28, 2008; December 7, 2007; November 16, 2007; August 3, 2007; June 22, 2007; March 23, 2007; November 17, 2006; August 4, 2006; June 23, 2006; May 5, 2006; March 24, 2006; December 2, 2005; November 18, 2005; August 5, 2005; June 24, 2005; May 5, 2005; November 19, 2004; August 6, 2004; June 25, 2004; May 7, 2004; November 14, 2003; August 1, 2003; May 2, 2003; February 28, 2003; November 15, 2002; November 1, 2002; September 27, 2002; August 2, 2002; May 1, 2002; November 2, 2001; August 3, 2001; June 29, 2001; May 1, 2001; November 3, 2000; July 28, 2000; May 1, 2000; March 17, 2000; December 17, 1999; November 19, 1999; August 6, 1999; May 14, 1999; November 3, 1998; October 16, 1998; August 7, 1998; May 1, 1998; October 24, 1997; July 18, 1997; May 1, 1997; October 25, 1996; April 30, 1996; November 3, 1995; May 1, 1995.

November 16, 2017: Panelist, “Settlement and Pre-Trial Conferences: Do You Stay or Do You Go?”, Pittsburgh Marriott Center, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. The hour-long session focused on questions from practitioners about best practices at pre-trial conferences and pre-trial settlement negotiations. I have no notes, transcripts or recordings. Sponsored by Employment Law Institute West,

Jocelyn Greenaway, Pennsylvania Bar Institute, 5080 Ritter Road,  
Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania 17055-6903.

November 15, 2017: Speaker, 150th Anniversary of Federal Court Proceedings in  
Erie, Pennsylvania, United States Courthouse, Erie, Pennsylvania. Remarks are  
supplied. Press available at: <http://www.goerie.com/news/20171116/past-honored-at-erie-federal-courthouse>.

October 24, 2017: Speaker, Pennsylvania Bar Association Regional Dinner, Erie,  
Pennsylvania. I spoke about practicing in the Western District of Pennsylvania,  
Erie Division. Remarks are supplied.

September 15, 2017: Speaker, Constitution Day Youth Civic Engagement  
Symposium, United States Courthouse, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke about my role  
in the federal judiciary. I have no notes, transcripts or recording. Sponsored by  
Senator Toomey's Erie Office, 17 South Park Row, Erie, Pennsylvania 16501.

April 25, 2017: Keynote Address, "Issues in the Digital World," FBI Citizens  
Academy (FBICA) Graduation, Erie, Pennsylvania. Remarks are supplied.

April 4, 2017: Panelist, "Race and Criminal Justice: The Pipeline from Cradle to  
Prison," Eagle's Nest Leadership Corporation, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke about  
the possibility of a Re-Entry Court in the Erie Division of the Western District of  
Pennsylvania. I have no notes, transcripts or recordings. The address for the  
Eagle's Nest Leadership Corporation is 1129 Pennsylvania Avenue, Erie,  
Pennsylvania 16503.

February 16, 2017: Panelist, "ADR Program: 10 Years in the Making," sponsored  
by the Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. The panel discussed the  
early ADR Program of the United States District Court for the Western District of  
Pennsylvania on its Tenth Anniversary. I have no notes, transcript or recording.  
The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie,  
Pennsylvania 16507.

September 16, 2016: Speaker, Constitution Day Youth Civic Engagement  
Symposium, United States Courthouse, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke about my role  
in the federal judiciary. I have no notes, transcripts or recording. Sponsored by  
Senator Toomey's Erie Office, 17 South Park Row, Erie, Pennsylvania 16501.

April 28, 2015: Moderator, "A View from the Bench: Third Circuit Judges  
Present Notable Cases of the Past Year," Allegheny County Bar Association,  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. The presentation was a review of recent decisions by  
the Third Circuit Court of Appeals. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The

address for the Allegheny County Bar Association is 400 Koppers Building, 436 Seventh Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219.

November 26, 2014: Panelist, "How to Effectively Use Alternative Dispute Resolution in the Western District of Pennsylvania," sponsored by the Federal Bar Association and the Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. The panel discussed the Alternative Dispute Resolution program offered by the Western District of Pennsylvania. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Federal Bar Association is 1220 North Fillmore Street, Suite 444, Arlington, Virginia 22201.

September 26, 2014: Master of Ceremonies, "Overcoming Challenges for Women Lawyers: Myths about Women in Law, Why Women Lawyers Leave and How to Survive as Women Lawyers," Erie County Bar Association – Women's Division, Erie, Pennsylvania. I gave an extemporaneous introduction of the keynote speaker, Susan Smith Blakely. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

June 3, 2014: Master of Ceremonies, Women's Bar Association, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. I gave welcoming remarks. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

October 15, 2013: Panelist, Women in Criminal Justice Leadership, Mercyhurst University, Erie, Pennsylvania. The panel answered a set of questions provided by Mercyhurst University, a copy of which is supplied. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for Mercyhurst University is 501 East 38th Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16504.

April 23, 2013: Keynote Speaker, Induction Ceremony, Alpha Phi Sigma Honor Society, Mercyhurst University, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

November 4, 2012: Speaker, Open House, Mercyhurst Preparatory High School, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

September 28, 2012: Panelist, "Mediation of Prisoner's Civil Rights Cases – Pro Se Prisoner Mediation Pilot Program," Mediation Council of Western Pennsylvania, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. I spoke about mediation of prisoners' civil rights cases. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Mediation Council of Western Pennsylvania is Post Office Box 23698, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222.

June 28, 2011: Keynote Speaker, Scholarship Banquet, Erie Community Foundation, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

March 8, 2010: Keynote Speaker, Celebration of International Women's Day, Women's Council, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

May 13, 2009: Speaker, Woman of the Year Banquet, hosted by the Woman's Roundtable, Erie, Pennsylvania. Remarks are supplied.

January 31, 2008: Speaker, Portrait Dedication, United States Courthouse for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

May 8, 2007: Keynote Speaker, Volunteer Banquet, State Correctional Institution, Albion, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

2006 – 2007: Speaker, Alternative Dispute Resolution Pilot Program, United States Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke at various large local law firms about the initiation of the Alternative Dispute Resolution pilot program and the new local rules. I have no notes, transcripts or recording. The address for the United States Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania is 17 South Park Row, Erie, Pennsylvania 16501.

May 2006: Speaker, Law Enforcement Memorial Service, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

Spring 2003: Speaker, Role of a Magistrate Judge, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

November 9, 2001: Speaker, Investiture Ceremony, United States Courthouse for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

Spring 2001: Speaker, "The Federal Courts," Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

March 20, 2001: Speaker, Kiwanis Club of Golden K, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

December 12, 2000: Speaker, "Federal Court Nuts and Bolts," Practicum for New Attorneys, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. My comments focused on practical matters such as where and how to file a federal action, subpoenas, and service of process. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

September 2000: Speaker, Harding Elementary School, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke to the seventh and eighth grade classes about the U.S. Constitution. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for Harding Elementary School is 820 Lincoln Avenue, Erie, Pennsylvania 16505.

May 4, 2000: Speaker, League of Women Voters of Crawford County, Conneaut Lake, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

March 23, 2000: Speaker, "Responding to a Habeas Corpus Petition," Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. My remarks focused on preparing a response to a federal habeas corpus petition for the criminal defense lawyer. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

December 10, 1999: Speaker, "Federal Court Nuts and Bolts," Practicum for New Attorneys, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. My comments focused on practical matters such as where and how to file a federal action, subpoenas, and service of process. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

Fall 1999: Speaker, Welcome to the Court, United States Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke to the Pfeiffer-Burleigh Elementary School Brownie Troop about the law and courts generally. I have no notes, transcripts or recording. The address for the United States Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania is 17 South Park Row, Erie, Pennsylvania 16501.

May 17, 1999: Speaker, Women's Club, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

October 9, 1997: Speaker, "Supreme Court in Review," Bench-Bar Conference, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. Notes are supplied.

1997 – 2001: Panelist, "Use of Part-time Magistrate Judges," Magistrate Judge Educational Conferences, Federal Judicial Center, Washington, D.C. I spoke about the utilization of part-time magistrate judges in the Western District of Pennsylvania on several panels during this time period. I have no dates, notes, transcripts or recording of any of these panels. The address of the Federal Judicial Center is One Columbus Circle NE, Washington, District of Columbia 20002.

1997 – 2001: Panelist, "Reports and Recommendations on Petitions for Habeas Corpus," Magistrate Judge Educational Conferences, Federal Judicial Center, Washington, D.C. I spoke about petitions for habeas corpus twice during this

time period. I have no dates, notes, transcripts or recording of any of these panels. The address for the Federal Judicial Center is One Columbus Circle NE, Washington, District of Columbia 20002.

1995 – 1999: Moderator, “Legal Jeopardy,” Bench-Bar Conferences, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. I participated in a law-oriented variation of the game show “Jeopardy.” I have no notes, transcript or recording of these events. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

June 1995: Speaker, Criminal Practice, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. I spoke on habeas corpus practice in the federal courts. I have no notes, transcript or recording. The address for the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

March 8, 1995: Speaker, Investiture Ceremony, United States Courthouse for the Western District of Pennsylvania, Erie, Pennsylvania. Transcript is supplied.

1995 – 2008: Judge, Mock Trial Competitions, Erie County Bar Association, Erie, Pennsylvania. I advised high school students on good trial advocacy during the competition in various years throughout this time period. I have no notes, transcript or recording of these events. The address of the Erie County Bar Association is 429 West Sixth Street, Erie, Pennsylvania 16507.

1995 – 2013: Judge and Coordinator, Trial of the Big Bad Wolf for local elementary school children, which was performed at various times throughout this time period. The script was provided by the Federal Judicial Center. I have no notes, transcript or recording of my remarks. The address for the Federal Judicial Center is One Columbus Circle NE, Washington, District of Columbia 20002.

Outside of wholly personal speeches or talks I may have given—for example, toasts, eulogies, and religious instruction or commentary—the above represents my best recollection of all speeches or talks I have delivered since high school.

- e. List all interviews you have given to newspapers, magazines or other publications, or radio or television stations, providing the dates of these interviews and one (1) electronic copy of the clips or transcripts of these interviews where they are available to you.

*WICU-TV/WSEE-TV News* (NBC/CBS television broadcast Jan. 30, 2015). Video supplied.

*WJET-TV/FOX 66 News* (ABC/Fox television broadcast Jan. 30, 2015). Video supplied.

Mackenzie Stasko, *U.S. Magistrate Judge Susan Paradise Baxter Celebrates 20 Years on the Federal Bench*, Erie TV News, Jan. 30, 2015. Copy supplied.

*WICU-TV/WSEE-TV News* (NBC/CBS television broadcast June 3, 2014). I commented on the kick-off event for the Women's Division of the Erie County Bar Association. I could not locate a copy of this interview.

Tracy Carbasho, *Judge Sean McLaughlin Assumes Role as Chief Judge of U.S. District Court*, Allegheny County Bar Association, June 14, 2013. Copy supplied.

Lindsey Poisson, *100th Anniversary of Titanic's Voyage, Sinking Commemorated With Shows*, Erie Times-News, April 13, 2012. Copy supplied.

Robb Frederick, *Funding Boost*, Erie Times-News, March 6, 2011. Copy supplied.

Cody Switzer and Scott Waldman, *Returning Students Say Airport Security Worth Inconvenience*, Erie Times-News, Aug. 15, 2006. Copy supplied.

Emily Baxter, *Moms, Daughters Cast in New Roles*, Erie Times-News, Sept. 18, 2003. Copy supplied.

Robin Cuneo, *Dermatologist/Minister Heals Skin, Souls*, Erie Times-News, July 5, 2003. Copy supplied.

Julie Gardner, *Kids Help Usher in Baxter as Official U.S. Magistrate Judge*, Erie Times-News, Nov. 11, 2001. Copy supplied.

Albert J. Neri, *Three County Women Are Members of Revived State Commission*, Erie Times-News, Jan. 27, 1998. Copy supplied.

Marisa Moks-Unger, *Ties That Bind . . . and Trip*, Erie Times-News, June 27, 1997. Copy supplied.

*Roses and Thorns*, Erie Times-News, March 22, 1996. Copy supplied.

John Guerriero, *Federal Magistrate Sworn In*, Erie Times-News, March 9, 1995. Copy supplied.

*WJET-TV News* (ABC television broadcast Mar. 8, 1995). I commented on my investiture ceremony. Video supplied.



13. **Judicial Office:** State (chronologically) any judicial offices you have held, including positions as an administrative law judge, whether such position was elected or appointed, and a description of the jurisdiction of each such court.

Since January 20, 1995, I have served as United States Magistrate Judge appointed by the United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania. Our court is a federal trial court of general jurisdiction, and my authority is defined by 28 U.S.C. § 636.

- a. Approximately how many cases have you presided over that have gone to verdict or judgment?

I have presided over 20 cases that have gone to verdict or judgment.

- i. Of these, approximately what percent were:

jury trials:	66%
bench trials:	34%
civil proceedings:	66%
criminal proceedings:	34%

- b. Provide citations for all opinions you have written, including concurrences and dissents.

As a magistrate judge since 1995, I have filed thousands of civil reports and recommendations and issued thousands of civil and criminal orders. Since July 1, 2005, the Western District of Pennsylvania has used the Electronic Case Filing docketing system and Westlaw independently publishes nearly every opinion from that system. Before July 1, 2005, I submitted only a few opinions to West for publication. Over 1,350 of my written opinions are available on Westlaw, a list of which is attached. All paper files (from January 20, 1995, through June 30, 2005) are archived at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

- c. For each of the 10 most significant cases over which you presided, provide: (1) a capsule summary of the nature the case; (2) the outcome of the case; (3) the name and contact information for counsel who had a significant role in the trial of the case; and (3) the citation of the case (if reported) or the docket number and a copy of the opinion or judgment (if not reported).

1. *Byrd v. Aaron's, Inc.*, Civil Action 11-101 Erie, 2014 WL 1316055 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 31, 2014) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation on class certification); *rev'd and remanded*, 784 F.3d 154 (3d Cir. Apr. 16, 2015). A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation on motions to dismiss and Judge Bissoon's final orders are supplied.

The plaintiffs, a Wyoming couple who leased a laptop computer from an Aaron's Inc. franchisee store, alleged that defendants, the franchisee store and the Aaron's corporation, violated their statutory rights under the Wiretap Act and the Computer Fraud and Abuse Act by installing and using spyware on the computer. The spyware enabled the store's employees to capture and record screenshots and keystrokes from and take photographs through the laptop. This matter is ongoing with issues of personal jurisdiction, preliminary injunctive relief, and class certification at the fore.

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Frederick S. Longer  
Levin, Fishbein, Sedran & Berman  
510 Walnut Street, Suite 500  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19106  
215-592-1500

Andrea S. Hirsch  
Herman Gerel  
230 Peachtree Street, NW, Suite 2260  
Atlanta, Georgia 30303  
404-880-9500

Counsel for Defendant Aaron's Inc.

Richard A. Lanzillo  
Knox, McLaughlin, Gornall & Sennett  
120 West Tenth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-459-2800

Kristine McAlister Brown  
Alston & Bird LLP  
1201 West Peachtree Street  
Atlanta, Georgia 30309  
404-881-7000

Counsel for Defendant Aspen Way Enterprises, Inc.

Anthony J. Willott  
Marshall, Dennehey, Warner, Coleman & Goggin  
2900 U.S. Steel Tower  
600 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-803-1193

Counsel for Defendant Designerware, LLC

Brian M. Mancos  
[formerly of Burns White LLC]  
First National Bank of Pennsylvania  
One FNB Boulevard  
Hermitage, Pennsylvania 16148  
724-983-3497

David B. White  
Burns White LLC  
Four Northshore Center  
106 Isabella Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15212  
412-995-3210

2. *Darden-Munsell v. Dutch Maid Logistics, Inc.*, Civil Action 10-103 Erie, 2011 WL 3325863 (W.D. Pa. July 13, 2011) (report and recommendation), 2011 WL 3299087 (W.D. Pa. Aug. 2, 2011) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation); *Liberow v. Dutch Maid Logistics, Inc.*, Civil Action 10-154 Erie; *Azoulay v. Dutch Maid Logistics, Inc.*, Civil Action 10-266 Erie.

These were diversity actions that arose out of multiple automobile/truck accidents on Interstate 80, which resulted in numerous injuries and three fatalities. Counterclaims and cross-claims were included. The three separate cases were consolidated for purposes of discovery. All three cases settled separately.

Counsel for Plaintiff Darden-Munsell  
Frank M. Gianola (retired)

Pasquale Ciccodicola  
Law Office of Pasquale Ciccodicola, PLLC  
31250 Plymouth Road  
Livonia, Michigan 48150  
734-427-7999

Brad D. Trust  
Edgar Snyder & Associates  
[formerly of Dell, Moser, Lane & Loughney]  
600 Grant Street, Tenth Floor  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-394-5481

Counsel for Plaintiff Liberow  
Michael Louik  
Neil R. Rosen

Rosen, Louik & Perry  
The Frick Building  
437 Grant Street, Suite 200  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-281-4200

Counsel for Plaintiff Azoulay  
John P. Gismondi  
Gismondi & Associates  
310 Grant Street, Suite 700  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-281-2200

Counsel for Defendants Dutch Maid Logistics and Davis  
John T. Pion  
James M. Girman  
Pion, Nerone, Girman, Winslow & Smith, P.C.  
1500 Gateway Center  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222  
412-281-2288

Counsel for Defendant Wiers Farm, Inc.  
Gina Zumpella  
Paul J. Walsh, III  
[formerly of Litchfield Cavo, LLP]  
Walsh, Barnes, Collis & Zumpella, P.C.  
707 Grant Street, Suite 1400  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-258-2255

3. *Packaging Eng'g, LLC v. Werzalit of America, Inc.*, Civil Action 08-170 Erie, 2011 WL 3606884 (W.D. Pa. Aug. 12, 2011) (mem. opinion).

A packaging engineering company brought a breach of contract claim against a manufacturer for failing to design and produce a tool and die set to be used to manufacture wood containers for the storage and shipment of automotive windshields. I granted defendant's motion to exclude evidence of lost profits because the claim was nothing more than speculative. After a four-day jury trial, the verdict was for the defendant company.

Counsel for Plaintiff  
Donald F. Fessler, Jr.  
Marnen Mioduszewski Bordonaro Wagner & Sinnott LLC  
516 West Tenth Street

Erie, Pennsylvania 16502  
814-874-3460

W. Patrick Delaney  
MacDonald, Illig, Jones & Britton  
100 State Street, Suite 700  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16507  
814-870-7658

Counsel for Defendant

Richard A. Lanzillo  
Knox, McLaughlin, Gornall & Sennett  
120 West Tenth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-459-2800

4. *Cauvel v. Schwan Home Serv., Inc.*, Civil Action 08-134 Erie, 2009 WL 82489 (W.D. Pa. Jan. 9, 2009) (opinion and order); 2010 WL 5476698 (W.D. Pa. Dec. 31, 2010) (opinion and order), *rev'd and remanded*, 458 Fed. Appx. 131 (3d Cir. Jan. 20, 2012).

A former employee claimed that he was wrongfully terminated because he refused to take a polygraph test when money went missing in the business. The employer counterclaimed for conversion, breach of fiduciary duty and breach of employment contract. I denied the employee's motion to dismiss the counterclaim, and later granted the employer's motion for summary judgment while denying plaintiff's motion for summary judgment. The Third Circuit reversed as to the grant of defendant's motion for summary judgment, and the case was tried in a six-day jury trial. The verdict was for the defendant company with approximately \$21,000 damages awarded.

Counsel for Plaintiff

John David Newborg  
428 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1600  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-301-5014

Counsel for Defendant

Liberty J. Weyandt  
Charles H. Saul  
Margolis Edelstein  
525 William Penn Place, Suite 3300  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-281-4256

5. *Warner v. McVey*, Civil Action 08-55 Erie, 2008 WL 2498137 (W.D. Pa. June 18, 2008) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation on preliminary injunction); 2009 WL 703416 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 16, 2009) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation on motion to dismiss); 2010 WL 3239385 (W.D. Pa. July 9, 2009) (report and recommendation on summary judgment), 2010 WL 3239383 (W.D. Pa. Aug. 16, 2010) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation), *aff'd*, 429 Fed. Appx. 176 (3d Cir. 2011).

An Iowa probationer, who pled guilty to practicing medicine without a license, but in exchange had a charge of sexual abuse in the third degree dropped, filed a § 1983 action alleging that his right to procedural due process was violated when the Pennsylvania parole board designated him a “sex offender” and ordered him to participate in a sex offender treatment program. The case was dismissed on the basis of qualified immunity.

Counsel for Plaintiff

Arthur S. Cohen (deceased)

Counsel for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Scott A. Bradley  
Office of the Attorney General  
564 Forbes Avenue  
Sixth Floor, Manor Complex  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-565-7680

Counsel for non-Commonwealth Defendants

Matthew W. McCullough  
MacDonald, Illig, Jones & Britton  
100 State Street, Suite 700  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16507  
814-870-7600

6. *UPS Freight v. Nat’l Union Fire Ins. Co.*, Civil Action 06-137 Erie, 2007 WL 1880962 (W.D. Pa. June 26, 2007) (mem. order declining to adopt report and recommendation), *rev’d and remanded*, 428 Fed. Appx. 168 (3d Cir. 2011), *remanded to* 2012 WL 527650 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 14, 2012) (report and recommendation), 2012 WL 517197 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 16, 2012) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation). Copies of the unpublished reports and recommendations are supplied.

In this declaratory judgment action involving the duty to defend under an insurance contract, I issued a report and recommendation concluding, in part, that

the defendant insurance company owed a duty to defend the plaintiff in an underlying state court action, and recommending that the plaintiff be granted judgment accordingly. The district court rejected my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit vacated the district court's opinion and remanded, holding that the insurance company owed the plaintiff a duty to reimburse its defense costs throughout the underlying action. Upon remand, I again recommended that judgment be entered in favor of the plaintiff, consistent with the Third Circuit's opinion, and my report and recommendation was ultimately adopted by the district court.

Counsel for Plaintiff

Avrum Levicoff

The Levicoff Firm [formerly Levicoff, Silko & Deemer]

650 Smithfield Street, Suite 1900

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222

412-434-5200

Melissa A. Walls

[formerly of Levicoff, Silko & Deemer]

Segmiller & Mendicino

3700 South Water Street, Suite 130

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15203

412-227-5884

Counsel for Defendant National Union

D. John Travis

Gallagher Sharp

1501 Euclid Avenue

Sixth Floor, Bulkley Building

Cleveland, Ohio 44115

216-241-5310

Scott A. Wright

[formerly of Babst, Calland, Clements & Zomnir]

Limbach Facility Services

31 35th Street

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15201

412-359-2250

Counsel for Defendant C.C. Eastern

John W. Burns

Gordon Rees

707 Grant Street, Suite 3800

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

7. *Smith v. United States*, Civil Action 02-264 Erie, 2004 WL 1879212 (W.D. Pa. June 30, 2004) (report and recommendation); 2004 WL 2051218 (W.D. Pa. July 23, 2004) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

The plaintiff, a taxpayer, was seeking a refund of gift tax that was collected by the IRS on gifts of family limited partnership interests he made to each of his children during the 1998 tax year. In valuing the gifts, the plaintiff applied a marketability discount to the interests due to a restrictive provision contained in the family limited partnership agreement. The IRS subsequently reassessed the gift tax that was paid by the plaintiff based upon its application of § 2703(a) of the Internal Revenue Code. Pursuant to § 2703(a), the IRS disregarded the restrictive provision and disallowed the corresponding discount that was taken by the plaintiff, which resulted in the assessment of additional gift tax that the plaintiff paid under protest. The crux of the dispute involved the applicability of § 2703(a) to the restrictive provision at issue. At the time, this was a case of first impression as no other reported case had determined the applicability of § 2703(a) to a restrictive provision in a partnership agreement that fixes the price of a partnership interest at less than fair market value. The determination that § 2703 is applicable to such provisions has subsequently been followed by other courts addressing the same issue.

Counsel for Plaintiffs

James D. Cullen  
John Lauer  
W. Patrick Delaney  
MacDonald, Illig, Jones & Britton  
100 State Street, Suite 700  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16507  
814-870-7600

Counsel for the United States

Christy C. Wiegand  
United States Attorney's Office  
700 Grant Street, Suite 4000  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-894-7452

Ivan C. Dale  
United States Department of Justice  
Tax Division  
Ben Franklin Station  
Post Office Box 227



Washington, D.C. 20044  
202-307-6615

8. *Barrier Busters v. City of Erie*, Civil Action 02-203 Erie. Copies of the unpublished reports and recommendations are supplied.

The plaintiffs, a group of persons using “ambulatory devices for mobility,” brought a class action under the Americans with Disabilities Act claiming that the City of Erie failed to install ADA-compliant ramps at intersections of streets and sidewalks from 1992 through 2002. The named plaintiffs sought monetary damages, as well as declaratory and injunctive relief on behalf of the putative class. Amicus briefs were filed by the Civil Rights Division of the Department of Justice. The class was certified and the individual claims for monetary damages were limited to a two-year period preceding the filing of the action, while the class claims for declaratory and injunctive relief were permitted to relate back to 1992. Settlement negotiations followed in which the plaintiffs agreed to withdraw their individual claims and the parties entered into a consent decree. Following the entry of the first consent decree, the parties consented to the full jurisdiction of a magistrate judge, and I have exercised continuing jurisdiction over the consent decrees filed since 2004.

Counsel for Plaintiffs

J. Mark Finnegan  
Heberle & Finnegan  
2580 Craig Road  
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48103  
734-302-3233

Counsel for Defendant

Gerald J. Villella  
Assistant City Solicitor  
Erie City Hall  
626 State Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-870-1230

9. *DeFoy v. McCullough*, Civil Action 00-110 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 393 F.3d 439 (3d Cir. 2005) (remanded for merits determination), *cert. denied sub nom.*, *Patrick v. DeFoy*, 545 U.S. 1149 (2005), *remanded to* 2007 WL 2903922 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 28, 2007) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation dismissing petition on the merits), *aff'd*, 301 Fed. Appx. 177 (3d Cir. 2008), *cert. denied sub nom.*, *DeFoy v. Britton*, 556 U.S. 1273 (2009). A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation on exhaustion is supplied

This case involved a habeas petitioner who challenged the requirement that he admit guilt in order to qualify for the Commonwealth's Sex Offender Treatment Program as violative of the self-incrimination provision of the Fifth Amendment. By report and recommendation, I concluded that it was likely Mr. DeFoy could have filed a petition for a writ of mandamus in the Pennsylvania state courts and so had not exhausted his state court remedies for purposes of federal habeas corpus review. I recommended that a certificate of appealability be granted on this issue. The district judge adopted my report and recommendation in full. The Third Circuit granted a certificate of appealability on the exhaustion question I recommended, answering the question in the negative and remanding for a determination on the merits of the Fifth Amendment claim. By report and recommendation in this case of first impression, I concluded that the Sex Offender Treatment Program did not violate the petitioner's Fifth Amendment rights and recommended that the petition be dismissed. The district judge adopted the report and recommendation and the Third Circuit affirmed the decision on appeal.

Counsel for Petitioner

Thomas W. Patton  
Federal Public Defender's Office  
401 Main Street, Suite 1500  
Peoria, Illinois 61602  
309-671-7891

Counsel for Respondents

James K. Vogel  
[formerly of the Office of District Attorney of Erie County]  
Federal Law Enforcement Training Center  
Townhouse 374  
Glynco, Georgia 31524  
912-267-2718

Scott A. Bradley  
Office of the Attorney General  
564 Forbes Avenue  
Sixth Floor, Manor Complex  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-565-7680

10. *Majeed v. Walters*, Civil Action 98-62 Erie. A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation is supplied.

Petitioner, an Iraqi immigrant who had been tortured during the Iran-Iraq war, challenged his conviction in a habeas corpus petition for indecent assault and

corruption of a minor based upon ineffective assistance of counsel and involuntariness of guilty plea. Counsel was appointed. Following an evidentiary hearing, I recommended that the writ be granted, and my report and recommendation was adopted by the district judge.

Counsel for Petitioner  
Thomas W. Patton  
Federal Public Defender's Office  
401 Main Street, Suite 1500  
Peoria, IL 61602  
309-671-7891

Counsel for Respondent  
Lisa M. Nelson  
[formerly of the Office of District Attorney of Erie County]  
U.S. Attorney's Office  
17 South Park Row, Room A330  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-452-2906

- d. For each of the 10 most significant opinions you have written, provide: (1) citations for those decisions that were published; (2) a copy of those decisions that were not published; and (3) the names and contact information for the attorneys who played a significant role in the case.

1. *A.L. v. Value Behavioral Health, Inc.*, 2010 WL 936112 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 24, 2010) (report and recommendation on class certification), 2010 WL 936076 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 12, 2010) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation). Copies of unpublished reports and recommendations regarding motions to dismiss and motion for preliminary injunction are supplied.

Counsel for Plaintiffs  
John P. Corcoran, Jr.  
Jones, Gregg, Creehan & Gerace  
411 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1200  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-261-6400

Counsel for Defendant Value Behavioral Health  
E. Thomas Henefer  
Stevens & Lee  
111 North Sixth Street  
Post Office Box 679  
Reading, Pennsylvania 19603

610-478-2223

Counsel for Defendant Northwest Behavioral Health

Carla P. Maresca  
Deasey, Mahoney & Valentini  
1601 Market Street, Suite 3400  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
215-587-9400

Counsel for Defendant Southwest Behavioral Health

Sheryl L. Brown  
Siana, Bellwoar & McAndrew  
941 Pottstown Pike, Suite 200  
Chester Springs, Pennsylvania 19425  
610-321-5500

Counsel for Defendant Richman

Scott A. Bradley  
Mary Lynch Friedline  
Office of the Attorney General  
564 Forbes Avenue, Sixth Floor, Manor Complex  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-565-7680

Counsel for Defendant Mercer County Behavioral Health

Dean F. Falavolito  
[formerly of Burns White LLC]  
Margolis Edelstein  
525 William Penn Place, Suite 3300  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-281-4256

2. *Sutley v. Int'l Paper Co.*, 2009 WL 703555 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 16, 2009) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

Counsel for Plaintiff

Lawrence R. Chaban  
Alpern Schubert P.C.  
330 Grant Street  
2727 Grant Building  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-765-1888

Counsel for Defendant

Brad A. Funari  
McGuire Woods  
625 Liberty Avenue  
23rd Floor, Dominion Tower  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222  
412-667-6000

3. *Grier v. Klem*, Civil Action 05-05 Erie, 2006 WL 1835805 (W.D. Pa. June 29, 2006), *vacated and remanded*, 591 F.3d 672 (3d Cir. 2010) (for reconsideration after the United States Supreme Court's decision in *District Attorney's Office for the Third Judicial District v. Osborne*, 557 U.S. 52 (2009)), *remanded to* 2011 WL 4971925 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 19, 2011) (report and recommendation), 2011 WL 5008326 (W.D. Pa. Oct. 19, 2011) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

Counsel for Plaintiff  
Anderson T. Bailey  
Jones Day  
500 Grant Street  
One Mellon Center, Suite 4500  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-391-3939

Charles T. Kotuby  
Jones Day  
51 Louisiana Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
202-879-5409

Counsel for Defendants  
Michael E. Burns  
Office of the District Attorney  
Erie County Courthouse  
140 West Sixth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-451-6349

4. *M. Hill v. LaManna*, 2007 WL 777007 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 12, 2007) & 2007 WL 776991 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 23, 2007); *Siggers v. LaManna*, 2007 WL 791521 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 14, 2007); *Kelly v. Sapko*, 2007 WL 805550 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 23, 2007), *aff'd*, 334 Fed. Appx. 487 (3d Cir. 2009); *Ward v. LaManna*, 2007 WL 791130 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 14, 2007), *aff'd*, 334 Fed. Appx. 487 (3d Cir. 2009); *K. Hill v. LaManna*, 2007 WL 805562 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 23, 2007), *aff'd*, 334 Fed. Appx. 487 (3d Cir. 2009).

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Richard A. Lanzillo  
Knox, McLaughlin, Gornall & Sennett  
120 West Tenth Street  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16501  
814-459-2800

Counsel for Defendants

Christy Wiegand  
Michael C. Colville  
Albert W. Schollaert  
United States Attorney's Office  
700 Grant Street, Suite 4000  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-644-3500

5. *Chang v. Hasbro, Inc.*, Civil Action 04-57 Erie. A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation, adopted by District Judge Sean McLaughlin, is supplied.

Counsel for Plaintiff

Darius Keyhani  
Jennifer M. Meredith  
[formerly of Meredith & Keyhani, PLLC]  
Lippes Mathias Wexler Friedman LLP  
665 Main Street, Suite 300  
Buffalo, New York 14203  
716-853-5100

Counsel for Defendant

Kim J. Landsman  
Golenbock Eiseman Assor Bell & Peskoe LLP  
437 Madison Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
212-907-7368

6. *Woods v. United States*, 2003 WL 21791241 (W.D. Pa. June 30, 2003) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Richard R. Tarantine  
Tarantine & Associates  
437 Grant Street, Suite 416

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-321-5229

Counsel for United States  
Amy Reynolds Hay (deceased)

Dara B. Oliphant  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Tax Division  
Post Office Box 227  
Ben Franklin Station  
Washington, D.C. 20044  
202-616-2470

7. *Slutzker v. Johnson*, Civil Action 99-1952 Pittsburgh, *aff'd*, 393 F.3d 373 (3d Cir. 2004). A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation, adopted by District Judge Gary L. Lancaster, is supplied.

Counsel for Petitioner  
Douglas Sughrue  
Attorneys Crosby & Sughrue  
428 Forbes Avenue, Suite 2400  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-391-0123

Counsel for Respondent  
Ronald M. Wabby, Jr.  
Office of the District Attorney  
401 Allegheny County Courthouse  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-350-3108

8. *Lines v. Wargo*, 271 F. Supp. 2d 649 (W.D. Pa. Jan. 10, 2003) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

Counsel for Plaintiff  
Witold J. Walczak  
American Civil Liberties Foundation of Pennsylvania  
313 Atwood Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213  
412-681-7864

Counsel for Defendant  
Seth A. Mendelsohn

[formerly of Office of Attorney General - Bureau of Consumer Protection]  
Insurance Department  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
1311 Strawberry Square  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
717-783-5079

9. *Nwanze v. Hahn*, 97 F. Supp. 2d 665 (W.D. Pa. 2000) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation), *aff'd*, 242 F.3d 521 (3d Cir. 2001).

Counsel for Petitioner  
Austen O. Nwanze, *pro se*

Counsel for Respondents  
Tina O. Miller  
[formerly of the United States Attorney's Office]  
Farrell & Reisinger, LLC  
300 Koppers Building  
436 Seventh Avenue  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-894-1381

10. *Szuchon v. Lehman*, Civil Action 94-195 Erie, *aff'd on other grounds*, 273 F.3d 299 (3d Cir. Nov. 20, 2001). A copy of the unpublished report and recommendation, adopted by District Judge William Standish, is supplied.

Counsel for Petitioner  
Caroline M. Roberto  
429 Fourth Avenue, Suite 500  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
412-391-4071

Counsel for Respondent  
Garrett A. Taylor  
[formerly of the Office of District Attorney of Erie County]  
Taylor & Taylor  
2525 West 26th Street, Suite 202  
Erie, Pennsylvania 16506  
814-806-1252

e. Provide a list of all cases in which certiorari was requested or granted.

Certiorari was requested, but denied, in each of the following cases:



*Torrence v. Thompson*, 565 U.S. 950 (2011)  
*Northrop v. Quintana*, 563 U.S. 1001 (2011)  
*Chambers v. Hathaway*, 563 U.S. 980 (2011)  
*Arango v. Winstead*, 560 U.S. 930 (2010)  
*Felgar v. Burkett*, 559 U.S. 949 (2010)  
*Latham v. United States*, 558 U.S. 973 (2009)  
*Burkey v. Lappin*, 558 U.S. 969 (2009)  
*Armann v. McKean*, 558 U.S. 835 (2009)  
*DeFoy v. McCullough*, 556 U.S. 1273 (2009)  
*Brown v. United States*, 555 U.S. 932 (2009)  
*Ditch v. Grace*, 552 U.S. 949 (2007)  
*Sims v. Sherman*, 550 U.S. 925 (2007)  
*Sontag v. United States District Court*, 549 U.S. 1210 (2007)  
*Sontag v. Mechling*, 531 U.S. 1195 (2001)  
*Bierley v. Connelly*, 529 U.S. 1050 (2000)

- f. Provide a brief summary of and citations for all of your opinions where your decisions were reversed by a reviewing court or where your judgment was affirmed with significant criticism of your substantive or procedural rulings. If any of the opinions listed were not officially reported, provide copies of the opinions.

*Haskell v. Superintendent Greene, SCI*, Civil Action 10-149 Erie, 2015 WL 5227855 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 8, 2015), *rev'd*, 866 F.3d 139 (3d Cir. 2017). I denied a petition for a writ of habeas corpus because the petitioner did not show perjured testimony had a substantial and injurious effect on the jury's verdict per *Brecht v. Abrahamson*, 507 U.S. 619 (1993). The Third Circuit reversed, in a case of first impression, holding that the *Brecht* standard does not apply when the state has knowingly failed to correct the perjured testimony.

*Byrd v. Aaron's, Inc.*, Civil Action 11-101 Erie, 2014 WL 1316055 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 31, 2014), *rev'd and remanded*, 784 F.3d 154 (3d Cir. Apr. 16, 2015). I recommended that the motion for class certification be denied based upon the threshold ascertainability requirement. The district judge adopted the report and recommendation as the opinion of the court. The Third Circuit reversed and remanded, clarifying the inquiry to be conducted on ascertainability.

*Henry v. City of Erie*, Civil Action 10-260 Erie, 2011 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 110562 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 28, 2011), *rev'd & remanded*, 728 F.3d 275 (3d Cir. 2013). I recommended that the defendant's motion to dismiss the plaintiff's state-created danger claim be denied, finding that the claim was sufficiently pled. The district court adopted my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit reversed and remanded with instructions to dismiss the state-created danger claim based on qualified immunity.

*Tindell v. Pennsylvania*, Civil Action 11-173 Erie. I revoked the prisoner-plaintiff's *in forma pauperis* status based upon the "three strikes" provision of the Prison Litigation Reform Act. The district court adopted my report and recommendation. The Third Circuit reversed acknowledging only two "strikes" at the time of my decision. Decisions supplied.

*Torrence v. Sobina*, Civil Action 10-217 Erie, 2011 WL 4473122 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 26, 2011), *vacated and remanded*, 455 Fed. Appx. 140 (3d Cir. Dec. 27, 2011). I ruled that the plaintiff's claims against the parole board were barred by Eleventh Amendment immunity and the plaintiff's action against the individual defendants was barred by the doctrine of claim preclusion. The Third Circuit vacated and remanded with instructions to grant the defendants summary judgment instead based upon the plaintiff's failure to exhaust his claims in accordance with the Prison Litigation Reform Act.

*Mutschler v. SCI Albion CHCA*, Civil Action 09-265 Erie, 2010 WL 3809849 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 23, 2010), *aff'd in part and rev'd in part*, 445 Fed. Appx. 617 (3d Cir. Sept. 27, 2011). I granted the defendants' motion to dismiss, finding that the plaintiff had failed to state a cause of action upon which relief may be granted. On appeal, the Third Circuit affirmed in part and reversed in part, holding that the plaintiff had stated one Eighth Amendment claim for deliberate indifference.

*DiLauri v. Mullen*, Civil Action 09-198 Erie, 2011 WL 1428092 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 13, 2011), *adopted by* 2011 WL 2415243 (W.D. Pa. June 13, 2011), *aff'd in part and vacated in part*, 477 Fed. Appx. 944 (3d Cir. 2012). I recommended that part of the plaintiff's claims be dismissed as time barred, and that some defendants be dismissed due to the plaintiff's failure to allege their personal involvement. The district court adopted my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit affirmed in part and vacated in part, finding that the plaintiff had sufficiently alleged the personal involvement of one of the defendants.

*Cauvel v. Schwan Home Servs., Inc.*, Civil Action 08-134 Erie, 2010 WL 5476698 (W.D. Pa. Dec. 31, 2010), *rev'd and remanded*, 458 Fed. Appx. 131 (3d Cir. Jan. 20, 2012). I granted the defendant's motion for summary judgment and denied the plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment. On appeal, the Third Circuit reversed and remanded, finding that there was a genuine issue of material fact as to whether the defendant required the plaintiff to submit to a polygraph test in order to retain his employment.

*Royster v. United States*, Civil Action 07-228 Erie, 2010 WL 936764 (W.D. Pa. Mar. 11, 2010), *rev'd and remanded*, 475 Fed. Appx. 417 (3d Cir. Mar. 30, 2012). I recommended that the plaintiff's FTCA claim be dismissed because he failed to timely exhaust his administrative remedies. The district court adopted my report

and recommendation and dismissed the case. The Third Circuit reversed and remanded, holding that the date on which the plaintiff's claim accrued was not adequately established in the record.

*UPS Freight v. Nat'l Union Fire Ins. Co.*, Civil Action 06-137 Erie, 2007 WL 1880962 (W.D. Pa. June 26, 2007), *vacated by* 428 Fed. Appx. 168 (3d Cir. 2011). I recommended that declaratory judgment be entered in favor of plaintiff as to the defendant insurance company's duty to defend the plaintiff in an underlying state court action. The district court rejected my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit Court vacated the district court's opinion and remanded in line with my recommendation.

*Nicholas v. Corbett*, Civil Action 06-129 Erie, 2007 WL 1163694 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 18, 2007); *Nicholas v. Heffner*, Civil Action 06-200 Erie, 2007 WL 1162979 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 18, 2007); *Nicholas v. Am. Detective Agency*, Civil Action 06-210 Erie, 2007 WL 1173676 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 18, 2007); *Nicholas v. Wood*, Civil Action 06-211 Erie, 2007 WL 1163528 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 18, 2007); *Nicholas v. Am. Detective Acad.*, Civil Action 06-219 Erie, 2007 WL 1164850 (W.D. Pa. Apr. 18, 2007). In each case, after previously denying the prisoner-plaintiff's motion to proceed *in forma pauperis* based upon the "three strikes" provision of the Prison Litigation Reform Act, I recommended the dismissal of each case due to the plaintiff's failure to prosecute after he refused to pay the filing fee. The district court adopted my report and recommendation in each case. The Third Circuit reversed and remanded, indicating that the plaintiff's "strikes" must be counted as of the time the complaint is filed. Decisions supplied.

*Alston v. Forsyth*, Civil Action 05-168 Erie, 2010 WL 95089 (W.D. Pa. Jan. 6, 2010), *rev'd and remanded*, 379 Fed. Appx. 126 (3d Cir. May 13, 2010). I recommended granting the defendant's summary judgment motion and the district court adopted my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit reversed and remanded, noting that the plaintiff was not given an opportunity to gather and identify evidence in response to a new argument raised in the reply brief.

*Grier v. Klem*, Civil Action 05-05 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 591 F.3d 672 (3d Cir. Jan. 12, 2010). In May of 2006, I recommended that the plaintiff's claim be dismissed based upon *Heck v. Humphrey*, 512 U.S. 477 (1994), and the district judge adopted my report and recommendation. A copy of the report and recommendation is supplied. Subsequently, the Supreme Court decided *Dist. Attorney's Office for the Third Judicial Dist. v. Osborne*, 557 U.S. 52 (2009), and the Third Circuit reversed and remanded, holding that a party may use a § 1983 action to request access to evidence for post-conviction DNA testing.

*Davila-Bajana v. Holohan*, Civil Action 04-253 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 309 Fed. Appx. 606 (3d Cir. Feb. 5, 2009). I recommended granting a motion to dismiss Eighth Amendment and FTCA claims based on an inmate's failure to exhaust his claims. The report and recommendation was adopted. Copy of report and recommendation and order are supplied. Later, I recommended granting summary judgment on the remaining retaliation claim and my recommendation was adopted, 2007 WL 11633 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 24, 2007). On appeal, the Third Circuit reversed and remanded on the dismissal of the Eighth Amendment claim, finding that the inmate had met the requirement of exhaustion.

*Armann v. Warden-McKean*, Civil Action 04-118 Erie, 2006 WL 2882954 (W.D. Pa. Oct. 6, 2006), adopted by 2007 WL 1576407 (W.D. Pa. May 31, 2007), *rev'd*, 549 F.3d 279 (3d Cir. 2008). I recommended that an evidentiary hearing be held in a habeas case challenging proceedings before a military tribunal. The district court adopted my report and recommendation. An interlocutory appeal was taken and the Third Circuit reversed, holding that the issue had been raised sufficiently before the appellate level of the military tribunal.

*Cooleen v. LaManna*, Civil Action 04-63 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 248 Fed. Appx. 357 (3d Cir. 2007). I recommended dismissal of the plaintiff's due process claim, and the granting of summary judgment in favor of the defendants on the plaintiff's Eighth Amendment and FTCA claims. A copy of the report and recommendation is supplied. The district court adopted my report and recommendation. On appeal, the Third Circuit affirmed the dismissal of the due process and FTCA claims, but reversed and remanded the dismissal of the Eighth Amendment claim..

*Camp v. Brennan*, Civil Action 98-180 Erie, *aff'd in part and rev'd in part*, 219 F.3d 279 (3d Cir. 2000). I recommended dismissal of the plaintiff's excessive force claims for failure to exhaust administrative remedies. The district court adopted the report and recommendation. These opinions are not available in the CM/ECF system and exist only in the paper files archived at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. On appeal, the Third Circuit affirmed that excessive force claims were subject to the statutory exhaustion requirement, but held that the plaintiff had met the exhaustion requirement.

*Jewell v. Reno*, Civil Action 97-408 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 297 F.3d 305 (3d Cir. 2002). In response to federal prisoners' challenge of two federal statutes, I recommended granting a motion for judgment on the pleadings as to the plaintiffs' facial challenge to the statutes, but denying the motion as to the plaintiffs' as-applied challenge to the statutes because defendants had not met their burden to produce evidence pursuant to *Turner v. Safley*, 482 U.S. 78 (1987). The district court adopted the former recommendation, but rejected the latter and granted defendants' motion for judgment on the pleadings on all bases. On

appeal, the Third Circuit reversed the district court and remanded in line with my recommendation.

*Nelson v. Jashurek*, Civil Action 95-97 Erie, *rev'd and remanded*, 109 F.3d 142 (3d Cir. 1997). I recommended that the plaintiff's claims be dismissed because they were barred by *Heck v. Humphrey*, 512 U.S. 477 (1994). The district court adopted the report and recommendation. These opinions are not available in the CM/ECF system and exist only in the paper files archived at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. On appeal, the Third Circuit reversed and remanded, holding that *Heck* does not bar one convicted of resisting arrest from bringing an excessive force claim.

- g. Provide a description of the number and percentage of your decisions in which you issued an unpublished opinion and the manner in which those unpublished opinions are filed and/or stored.

As a magistrate judge, I serve as both the presiding judge (in cases in which all the parties have consented to my jurisdiction) and as a referral judge. When cases are referred to the magistrate judge in the Western District of Pennsylvania, the magistrate judge manages all pretrial proceedings and issues opinions and/or reports and recommendations on those matters. All of my opinions and reports and recommendations, whether they are in consent cases or referral cases, were docketed electronically in the court's Electronic Case Filing system (CM/ECF) after July 2005. Since that time, I have not submitted any opinions for publication; instead, Westlaw and LEXIS independently publish opinions retrieved from the CM/ECF system. Prior to July of 2005, I published only a few of my hundreds of written opinions. All paper case files containing other written opinions are archived in the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

- h. Provide citations for significant opinions on federal or state constitutional issues, together with the citation to appellate court rulings on such opinions. If any of the opinions listed were not officially reported, provide copies of the opinions.

*Grier v. Klem*, Civil Action 05-05 Erie, 2011 WL 4971925 (W.D. Pa. Sept. 19, 2011) (report and recommendation), 2011 WL 5008326 (W.D. Pa. Oct. 19, 2011) (mem. order adopting report and recommendation).

*Lines v. Wargo*, 271 F. Supp. 2d 649 (W.D. Pa. 2003) (mem. order and report and recommendation).

- i. Provide citations to all cases in which you sat by designation on a federal court of appeals, including a brief summary of any opinions you authored, whether majority, dissenting, or concurring, and any dissenting opinions you joined.

I have not sat by designation on a federal court of appeals.

14. **Recusal:** If you are or have been a judge, identify the basis by which you have assessed the necessity or propriety of recusal (If your court employs an "automatic" recusal system by which you may be recused without your knowledge, please include a general description of that system.) Provide a list of any cases, motions or matters that have come before you in which a litigant or party has requested that you recuse yourself due to an asserted conflict of interest or in which you have recused yourself sua sponte. Identify each such case, and for each provide the following information:

- a. whether your recusal was requested by a motion or other suggestion by a litigant or a party to the proceeding or by any other person or interested party; or if you recused yourself sua sponte;
- b. a brief description of the asserted conflict of interest or other ground for recusal;
- c. the procedure you followed in determining whether or not to recuse yourself;
- d. your reason for recusing or declining to recuse yourself, including any action taken to remove the real, apparent or asserted conflict of interest or to cure any other ground for recusal.

I follow the federal recusal statutes and the Code of Conduct for United States Judges. Our court utilizes an "automatic" recusal system whereby judges list lawyers and/or other individuals/entities from whose cases they need to recuse due to existing or prior relationships and/or the appearance of impropriety. As such, I may be recused in a small number of cases without my knowledge or intervention. There have been a few cases in which I have recused myself based upon a conflict not readily apparent at the outset. I am asked to recuse myself in many *pro se* prisoner cases, mainly due to an unsuccessful outcome on a motion or a previous case before me. Although I do not have records of most of my decisions regarding *pro se* prisoner recusal requests, I am certain that all such requests have been denied to the extent they have been based upon my past unfavorable decisions.

*Argonaut Great Cent. Ins. Co. v. Highland Twp.*, Civil Action 17-29 Erie. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, as the details of the carrier's coverage here may have prejudiced certain parties in two related cases on my docket.

*McManus v. Family Servs. of NW PA*, Civil Action 16-222 Erie. I recused myself from this case *sua sponte*, based on a conflict with defendant counsel's law firm.

*Johnson v. Mogel*, Civil Action 15-35 Erie. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, based on the employment relationship of the defendant court reporter with the district court.

*Brown v. Wetzel*, Civil Action 14-1204 Pittsburgh. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, because I was the victim of the plaintiff's conduct that was the subject of his pending criminal case and conviction.

*Long v. Equicross*, Civil Action 13-61 Erie. At the request of both parties, I recused myself from consideration of the parties' motion to enforce settlement due to my knowledge of information disclosed during settlement discussions.

*Carrasquillo v. Wetzel*, Civil Action 12-21 Erie. I denied the plaintiff's motion for recusal that was based upon his perception that I was biased against him because of my unfavorable rulings on prior motions.

*Tindell v. Pennsylvania*, Civil Action 11-173 Erie. I denied the plaintiff's two motions for my recusal based upon his dissatisfaction with my prior rulings against him.

*United States v. Brown*, Criminal Action 11-34 Erie. I recused myself from the preliminary criminal proceedings against this defendant, *sua sponte*, because he was indicted for making threats against me and District Judge McLaughlin.

*Hawkins v. Brooks*, Civil Action 09-98 Erie. I denied the plaintiff's motion for recusal, which was based on her allegations that I was biased against her.

*Ferguson v. DiGuglielmo*, Civil Action 09-72 Erie. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, because the petitioner's underlying crime included the burglary of my law clerk's home.

*Muhammed v. U.S. Marshal Serv.*, Civil Action 07-27 Erie. I recused myself from this case on the request of the plaintiff because he claimed that my being assigned the case thwarted him from naming me as a defendant in it.

*Rankine v. Folino*, Civil Action 04-100 Erie. I denied the plaintiff's motion for recusal, which alleged that I had recommended that his motion for temporary restraining order be denied previously.

*Young v. CNA Ins. Cos.*, Civil Action 02-103 Erie. My recusal is unclear from my personal files. The records of this case were maintained prior to digital storage of

docket entries and are now archived by the court at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

*Whetstine v. Corr. Physicians Servs.*, Civil Action 99-392 Erie. My recusal is unclear from my personal files. The records of this case were maintained prior to digital storage of docket entries and are now archived by the court at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

*Lassen v. Bozza*, Civil Action 97-222 Erie. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, based on the subsequent hiring of defendant Humphrey as a law clerk for District Judge McLaughlin and her friendship with me.

*Cozzens v. Brennan*, Civil Action 96-366 Erie. I recused myself from this case, *sua sponte*, when I discovered well into the matter that I had some involvement with the petitioner's Post Conviction Relief Act petition in the Erie County Court during the short time I was the court solicitor there.

*Millcreek Twp. v. General Electric Corp.*, Civil Action 95-69 Erie. My recusal is unclear from my personal files. The records of this case were maintained prior to digital storage of docket entries and are now archived by the court at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

*Pearson v. Component Tech. Corp.*, Civil Action 94-293 Erie. My recusal is unclear from my personal files. The records of this case were maintained prior to digital storage of docket entries and are now archived by the court at the Federal Records Center in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

15. **Public Office, Political Activities and Affiliations:**

- a. List chronologically any public offices you have held, other than judicial offices, including the terms of service and whether such positions were elected or appointed. If appointed, please include the name of the individual who appointed you. Also, state chronologically any unsuccessful candidacies you have had for elective office or unsuccessful nominations for appointed office.

In 1998, I was appointed as a member of the Governor's Pennsylvania Commission for Women by then-Governor Tom Ridge. I served until 2000.

- b. List all memberships and offices held in and services rendered, whether compensated or not, to any political party or election committee. If you have ever held a position or played a role in a political campaign, identify the particulars of the campaign, including the candidate, dates of the campaign, your title and responsibilities.



I have never worked on any campaign nor have I held any office in a political party or election committee.

16. **Legal Career:** Answer each part separately.

a. Describe chronologically your law practice and legal experience after graduation from law school including:

- i. whether you served as clerk to a judge, and if so, the name of the judge, the court and the dates of the period you were a clerk;

I have not served as a law clerk.

- ii. whether you practiced alone, and if so, the addresses and dates;

I have never practiced alone.

- iii. the dates, names and addresses of law firms or offices, companies or governmental agencies with which you have been affiliated, and the nature of your affiliation with each.

1983 – 1992

Cole, Raywid & Braverman (now Davis Wright Tremaine LLP)

1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, District of Columbia 20006

Associate (1983 – 1989)

Partner (1989 – 1992)

1994

Court of Common Pleas of Erie County

140 West Sixth Street

Erie, Pennsylvania 16501

Court Solicitor

- iv. whether you served as a mediator or arbitrator in alternative dispute resolution proceedings and, if so, a description of the 10 most significant matters with which you were involved in that capacity.

While in private practice, I never served as a mediator or arbitrator.

b. Describe:

- i. the general character of your law practice and indicate by date when its character has changed over the years.

From 1983 until 1992, I was a litigating associate and partner at Cole, Raywid & Braverman (now Davis Wright Tremaine LLP). The standard practice in my former firm was to assign more than one attorney per case. In this capacity, I litigated cases for our clients as plaintiffs and defended them when sued. A number of my cases went to trial, although most settled or were decided on dispositive motions. In 1994, after my family moved to Erie, I became the Court Solicitor for the Erie County Court of Common Pleas, working with the then-President Judge during a conflict with the County Executive and County Council, whose solicitor typically represents the judges of the county court. After a short time in that position, I was appointed United States Magistrate Judge.

- ii. your typical clients and the areas at each period of your legal career, if any, in which you have specialized.

As an associate and partner in my former firm, I represented a wide range of corporate clients, the majority of which were broadcast or cable television companies, on corporate matters and contract disputes, among other issues. I was an attorney of record on several class-action lawsuits including one that was in trial for six months. At all times, my practice was litigation principally in federal courts.

- c. Describe the percentage of your practice that has been in litigation and whether you appeared in court frequently, occasionally, or not at all. If the frequency of your appearances in court varied, describe such variance, providing dates.

Between 1983 and 1992, I was a litigator and appeared in court as required in my civil practice. I typically appeared with at least one other member of my law firm and made arguments or examined witnesses as required. Occasionally our cases were brought in state courts around the country, but mainly the issues and diverse parties required that they be brought in the federal courts.

- i. Indicate the percentage of your practice in:

- |                             |     |
|-----------------------------|-----|
| 1. federal courts:          | 97% |
| 2. state courts of record:  | 3%  |
| 3. other courts:            | 0%  |
| 4. administrative agencies: | 0%  |

- ii. Indicate the percentage of your practice in:

- |                          |      |
|--------------------------|------|
| 1. civil proceedings:    | 100% |
| 2. criminal proceedings: | 0%   |

- d. State the number of cases in courts of record, including cases before administrative law judges, you tried to verdict, judgment or final decision (rather than settled), indicating whether you were sole counsel, chief counsel, or associate counsel.

I was part of a litigation team on approximately 85 to 100 cases over the course of my private practice career. I was co-counsel on each, except for a pro bono matter that went to trial in a small claims court in the District of Columbia, which I handled alone. The majority of the cases were decided on summary judgment or settled. I estimate that my trial team went to trial in no more than ten cases, with one trial lasting for six months in the United States District Court for the District of Columbia. In each trial, I examined witnesses and made oral arguments as required.

- i. What percentage of these trials were:

- |              |     |
|--------------|-----|
| 1. jury:     | 98% |
| 2. non-jury: | 2%  |

- e. Describe your practice, if any, before the Supreme Court of the United States. Supply four (4) copies of any briefs, amicus or otherwise, and, if applicable, any oral argument transcripts before the Supreme Court in connection with your practice.

Respondent's Brief, *United States v. Sperry Corp.*, 493 U.S. 52 (1989) (No. 88-952). Copies supplied.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari, *Foltz v. U.S. News & World Report, Inc.*, 490 U.S. 1108 (1989) (No. 88-1766) (cert. denied). Petition available at 1989 WL 1174217.

17. **Litigation:** Describe the ten (10) most significant litigated matters which you personally handled, whether or not you were the attorney of record. Give the citations, if the cases were reported, and the docket number and date if unreported. Give a capsule summary of the substance of each case. Identify the party or parties whom you represented; describe in detail the nature of your participation in the litigation and the final disposition of the case. Also state as to each case:

- the date of representation;
- the name of the court and the name of the judge or judges before whom the case was litigated; and
- the individual name, addresses, and telephone numbers of co-counsel and of principal counsel for each of the other parties.

Because I have been on the bench for over twenty years, my private practice is dated. My former law firm was unable to access all of the matters on which I worked because the materials are archived and stored off-site. I have listed the cases where I am of record and where opinions are readily accessible.

1. *Kearney v. Prudential-Bache Securities Inc.*, Case No. 84-1625 (United States District Court for the Southern District of New York; Mukasey, J.).

I represented a commodities customer who sued traders for violations of the Commodities Exchange Act and the Securities Exchange Act of 1934. Summary judgment was granted for the defendant, 701 F. Supp. 416 (S.D.N.Y. 1988). I was part of the litigation team from approximately 1987 to 1988, particularly involved in depositions and briefing.

Co-Counsel: Margaret Haering  
Counsel and Assistant Director  
Healthcare Policy and Benefit Services  
Office of the State Comptroller  
55 Elm Street  
Hartford, CT 06106  
860-702-3486  
(formerly of Davis Wright Tremaine LLP)

Opposing Counsel: Joel Miller  
Miller & Wrubel  
570 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
212-336-3501

2. *Celia Anderson v. Department of Health and Human Services, et al.*, Case No. C-84-861-J (United States District Court for the District of Utah, Central Division, Jenkins, C.J.)

I represented the intervenor-defendant Dow Corning Corporation in a lawsuit alleging that defendant Food and Drug Administration wrongfully withheld documents under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), provided by Dow Corning regarding their product, which was a type of injectable silicone. Specifically, Dow's position was that the documents were exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4 of the Freedom of Information Act for trade secrets and confidential commercial information. Dow prevailed on summary judgment in the District Court. That judgment was reversed in part and remanded for more evidence, 907 F.3d 936 (10th Cir. 1990). I was part of the litigation team, from approximately 1989 to 1992, but did not argue before the Tenth

Circuit. (There are other record citations for this case in the District Court in Utah and the Tenth Circuit, but they post-date my departure from the firm).

Co-Counsel: Burt A. Braverman  
Davis Wright Tremaine LLP  
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202-973-4210

Harvey L. Steinberg (retired)

Ray R. Christensen  
Christensen & Jensen  
257 East 200 South  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
801-355-3472

Government Counsel: The Honorable Dee V. Benson  
Senior District Judge  
Frank E. Moss Courthouse  
350 South Main Street, Room 10-420  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
801-524-6160  
(formerly of the U.S. Attorney's Office)

Stephen Sorenson  
U.S. Attorney's Office  
185 South State Street  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
801-524-5682

Opposing Counsel: Edward T. Wells  
Solo Practitioner  
5286 South Commerce Drive  
Salt Lake City, UT 84107  
801-284-7278  
(formerly of Robert J. DeBry & Associates)

Robert DeBry  
Robert J. DeBry & Associates  
4252 South 700 East  
Salt Lake City, UT 84107  
800-574-5602

3. *Foltz v. U.S. News & World Report, Inc.*, Case No. 84-447 (United States District Court for the District of Columbia, Parker J.)

I represented the plaintiff class of two hundred and class representatives who were former employees and stockholders of U.S. News & World Report during a particular time period and who liquidated their stock and profit-sharing interests as required at termination under an employee stock ownership plan at alleged undervalued rates in violation of ERISA. Many other issues were addressed, particularly when the magazine was sold during the pendency of the case. The non-jury trial lasted for six months. Judgment was for the defendants. I was part of the litigation team during the entirety of the matter from 1984 to 1987, including the lengthy six-month trial. I examined witnesses at trial and argued motions before the trial judge. I was on the brief to the District of Columbia Circuit on two appeals.

Co-Counsel: Alan Raywid (deceased)

John Seiver  
Davis Wright Tremaine LLP  
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202-973-4210

Margaret Haering  
Counsel and Assistant Director  
Healthcare Policy and Benefit Services  
Office of the State Comptroller  
55 Elm Street  
Hartford, CT 06106  
860-702-3486  
(formerly of Davis Wright Tremaine LLP)

Opposing Counsel: Richard Wertheimer  
Black Swan ADR, LLC  
844 Glen Echo Trail  
Winston-Salem, NC 27106  
704-895-1792  
(formerly of Arnold & Porter)

Leslie A. Nicholson (retired)

Willis Snell (deceased)

Lawrence Latto (deceased)

4. *Hagerty v. Covell*, Case No. 83-Civ-2148 (United States District Court for the District of Columbia, Harris, J.)

I represented the president of a client company from 1983 to 1986 in a personal lawsuit against the builder of his multi-million dollar residence. Another associate and I took the case to a jury trial where we shared trial duties and won a verdict of \$69,000, plus costs, for our client.

Co-Counsel: John Seiver  
Davis Wright Tremaine LLP  
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202-973-4210

Opposing Counsel: James C. Gregg (deceased)

5. *Sperry Corporation v. United States*, Case No. 660-82C (United States Claims Court, Kozinski, C.J., Smith, C.J.)

After Sperry Corporation appeared at The Hague before the Iran-United States Claims Tribunal and secured an award for the confiscation of Sperry computer equipment in Iran after the U.S. Embassy there was seized in 1979, a percentage was automatically deducted as reimbursement for the expenses incurred during The Hague proceedings. Sperry sought to recover the amount as an unconstitutional taking, an improper user fee, and violative of the Origination Clause. The Federal Circuit held that the deduction was a per se taking of property without compensation and unconstitutional, reversing the United States Claims Court, 853 F.2d 904 (Fed. Cir. 1988). The Supreme Court reversed and remanded, holding that the deduction was not an unconstitutional taking, but remanding on the Origination Clause issue because the House of Representatives attempted to pass a retroactive bill to authorize the deduction. 493 U.S. 52 (1989). On remand, the Federal Circuit ruled that the Senate Act did not violate the Origination Clause because the law was not for raising revenue. 925 F.2d 399 (Fed. Cir. 1991). I was part of the litigation team on this case throughout its stages, from approximately 1983 to 1991, arguing in the Claims Court and on briefs on appeal and remand.

Co-Counsel: Alan Raywid (deceased)  
  
John D. Seiver  
Davis Wright Tremaine, LLP  
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202-973-4214

Opposing Counsel: Terrence S. Hartman

Administrative Judge – ASBCA  
Skyline Six, Suite 700  
5109 Leesburg Pike  
Falls Church, VA 22041  
703-681-8500  
(formerly of the U.S. Department of Justice)

18. **Legal Activities:** Describe the most significant legal activities you have pursued, including significant litigation which did not progress to trial or legal matters that did not involve litigation. Describe fully the nature of your participation in these activities. List any client(s) or organization(s) for whom you performed lobbying activities and describe the lobbying activities you performed on behalf of such client(s) or organizations(s). (Note: As to any facts requested in this question, please omit any information protected by the attorney-client privilege.)

Prior to 1995, I was an active member of the District of Columbia Bar Association, the Pennsylvania Bar Association, its Commission on Women in the Profession, and the Erie Bar Association. Since coming to the bench in 1995, I served on the National Advisory Council for Space and Security of the Judiciary and the circuit governance Space and Security Committee. I served on the Magistrate Judges Committee of the Third Circuit. I served on the Civil Rules Committee of the Federal Magistrate Judges Association when comments to proposed rule changes were drafted and published in 2013 and 2014. I chaired the Erie County Bar Association Mediation Committee, which drafted and implemented its current mediation program in 2003 and 2004, and served a term on its Board of Directors. I developed and implemented, and currently administer, the legal intern program for the United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania, in Erie, Pennsylvania. I was a member of the Northwest Pennsylvania American Inn of Court and served as its Program Director from 1999 to 2000.

I have never engaged in lobbying activities.

19. **Teaching:** What courses have you taught? For each course, state the title, the institution at which you taught the course, the years in which you taught the course, and describe briefly the subject matter of the course and the major topics taught. If you have a syllabus of each course, provide four (4) copies to the committee.

I have not taught any courses.

20. **Deferred Income/ Future Benefits:** List the sources, amounts and dates of all anticipated receipts from deferred income arrangements, stock, options, uncompleted contracts and other future benefits which you expect to derive from previous business relationships, professional services, firm memberships, former employers, clients or customers. Describe the arrangements you have made to be compensated in the future for any financial or business interest.



None.

21. **Outside Commitments During Court Service:** Do you have any plans, commitments, or agreements to pursue outside employment, with or without compensation, during your service with the court? If so, explain.

No.

22. **Sources of Income:** List sources and amounts of all income received during the calendar year preceding your nomination and for the current calendar year, including all salaries, fees, dividends, interest, gifts, rents, royalties, licensing fees, honoraria, and other items exceeding \$500 or more (if you prefer to do so, copies of the financial disclosure report, required by the Ethics in Government Act of 1978, may be substituted here).

See attached Financial Disclosure Report.

23. **Statement of Net Worth:** Please complete the attached financial net worth statement in detail (add schedules as called for).

See attached Net Worth Statement.

24. **Potential Conflicts of Interest:**

- a. Identify the family members or other persons, parties, categories of litigation, and financial arrangements that are likely to present potential conflicts-of-interest when you first assume the position to which you have been nominated. Explain how you would address any such conflict if it were to arise.

As a United States Magistrate Judge, I follow the federal recusal statutes and Code of Conduct for United States Judges. I assess recusal concerns in accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 455. I currently recuse myself from litigation involving close family friends, as well as cases involving the entities on whose boards I sit. I err on the side of recusal. If confirmed to be a district judge, I would continue to recuse myself should conflicts arise.

- b. Explain how you will resolve any potential conflict of interest, including the procedure you will follow in determining these areas of concern.

If confirmed, I will continue to carefully review and address any real or potential conflicts by reference to 28 U.S.C. § 455, Canon 3 of the Code of Conduct for United States Judges, and any other laws, rules, and practices governing such circumstances.

25. **Pro Bono Work:** An ethical consideration under Canon 2 of the American Bar Association's Code of Professional Responsibility calls for "every lawyer, regardless of professional prominence or professional workload, to find some time to participate in serving the disadvantaged." Describe what you have done to fulfill these responsibilities, listing specific instances and the amount of time devoted to each.

As a sitting judge, I am not permitted to perform pro bono legal work. In private practice, I handled a pro bono case for a Mali citizen employed by his embassy as a chauffeur, who was sued by the purchasers of his used car prior to his returning to Mali. The case went to trial in the District of Columbia Small Claims Court, and we prevailed. Despite contacting my former law partners, and reviewing my personal files, I do not have the case number or a recollection of the name of the case. Since my appointment to the bench, I have volunteered in non-legal ways in my community from washing supper dishes at least once a month at the Emmaus Soup Kitchen run by the Benedictine Sisters to sewing costumes for theatrical productions at my children's high school alma mater, among others.

26. **Selection Process:**

- a. Please describe your experience in the entire judicial selection process, from beginning to end (including the circumstances which led to your nomination and the interviews in which you participated). Is there a selection commission in your jurisdiction to recommend candidates for nomination to the federal courts? If so, please include that process in your description, as well as whether the commission recommended your nomination. List the dates of all interviews or communications you had with the White House staff or the Justice Department regarding this nomination. Do not include any contacts with Federal Bureau of Investigation personnel concerning your nomination.

I applied to fill the Erie Division vacancy when I became aware from the websites of Senator Robert Casey and Senator Patrick Toomey that they were soliciting applicants for the vacancy. I submitted my application electronically on August 23, 2013.

On October 24, 2013, I interviewed with the senators' selection committee in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. On January 27, 2015, I interviewed with Senator Casey and a staff member by videoconference. On February 17, 2015, I received a telephone call from Senator Casey's staff, who informed me that my name was being sent to the White House as the Senator's recommendation to fill the vacancy. On March 17, 2015, I met with Senator Casey and a staff member at the Senator's office in Washington, D.C. On that same day, I also met with Senator Toomey at his office in Washington, D.C.

On June 18, 2015, I interviewed with attorneys from the White House Counsel's Office and the Department of Justice in Washington, D.C. On July 30, 2015, the President submitted my nomination to the Senate. I testified before the Judiciary Committee of the United States Senate on December 9, 2015. I was voted out of committee by voice vote on January 28, 2016. My nomination expired at the close of the 114th Congress on January 3, 2017, and was returned to the president.

I received a telephone call on January 20, 2017, from Senator Casey that my name was being re-submitted for the vacancy. I interviewed with attorneys from the White House Counsel's Office and the Department of Justice in Washington, D.C. on May 8, 2017.

I have communicated regularly with the Department of Justice, Office of Legal Policy in the preparation of my answers to this questionnaire and the completion of other related materials. On December 20, 2017, the President submitted my nomination to the Senate.

- b. Has anyone involved in the process of selecting you as a judicial nominee discussed with you any currently pending or specific case, legal issue or question in a manner that could reasonably be interpreted as seeking any express or implied assurances concerning your position on such case, issue, or question? If so, explain fully.

No.